

Brendan P. Cullen (SBN 194057)
(cullenb@sullcrom.com)
Sverker K. Hogberg (SBN 244640)
(hogbergs@sullcrom.com)
Alexis C. Holmes (SBN 321393)
(holmesa@sullcrom.com)
SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
550 Hamilton Avenue
Palo Alto, CA 94301
Telephone: (650) 461-5600
Fax: (650): 461-5700

*Counsel for Defendants Wells Fargo &
Company, Charles W. Scharf, Kleber R.
Santos, and Carly Sanchez*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

SEB INVESTMENT MANAGEMENT AB
and WEST PALM BEACH FIREFIGHTERS'
PENSION FUND, Individually and On
Behalf of All Others Similarly Situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WELLS FARGO & COMPANY, CHARLES W.
SCHARF, KLEBER R. SANTOS and CARLY
SANCHEZ,

Defendants.

Case No. 3:22-cv-03811-TLT

~~[PROPOSED]~~ ORDER **[AS
MODIFIED]** REGARDING
DEFENDANTS' LR 79-5(c)(1)
STATEMENT IN RESPONSE TO
PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE
MOTION TO CONSIDER WHETHER
ANOTHER PARTY'S MATERIAL
SHOULD BE SEALED

On August 4, 2025, Plaintiffs filed an Administrative Motion to Consider Whether Another Party's Materials Should Be Sealed in Regard to Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment, Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason, and Certain Exhibits Attached Thereto (ECF No. 233). Having considered Plaintiffs' Motion the Declaration of Sharan Nirmul In Support of Plaintiffs' Motion, Defendants Wells Fargo & Company, Charles W. Scharf, Kleber R. Santos, and Carly Sanchez's (collectively, "Defendants") LR 79-5(c)(1) Statement in Response, and the Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen in Support of Defendants' Statement in Response, it is hereby **ORDERED** that the following materials shall remain under seal:

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Dkt. No. 236-5: Exhibit PX 5 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 266:3-5, 23; 267:10; 268:5, 19.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-9: Exhibit PX 9 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00141651.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names, employment information, and factual circumstances that can be used	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Dr. Joseph R. Mason		<p>to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	
Dkt. No. 236-10: Exhibit PX 10 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00070802-806.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, and personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Defendants seek to redact similar information as was redacted in ECF No. 208-2, which is a different version of the same email chain as PX 10. The Court approved the redactions to ECF No. 208-2 on March 25, 2025 (ECF No. 210).</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l</i></p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-11: Exhibit PX 11 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00157774, -777-780, -782, -785-800.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-13: Exhibit PX 13 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00072589-640, -643, -648-654.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names and employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"</i>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<p><i>Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Shopify Inc. v. Express Mobile, Inc.</i>, 2020 WL 4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 14, 2020); <i>American Auto. Ass'n of N. California, Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC</i>, 2019 WL 1206748, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019); <i>Opperman v. Path, Inc.</i>, 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 17, 2017).</p>	
<p>Dkt. No. 236-14: Exhibit PX 14 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason</p>	<p>Redacted Personal Identifying Information at pp. 2-44.</p> <p><i>See</i> ECF No. 208-14.</p>	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, and personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>This exact version of this document was filed with redactions as ECF No. 208-14. The Court approved the redactions to ECF No. 208-14 on March 25, 2025 (ECF No. 210).</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.</p>	<p>GRANTED</p>

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-15; Exhibit PX 15 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00599218, -222, -228, -230, -233-235, 237-238, -24-243, -246, -251-252, -262, -271-274, -291, -293, -297, -298, -301-302, -304, -305, -306-308, -311, -316, -317, -319, -321-322, -325, -326, -322, -336, -347, -355, -358, -359, -361-362, -364, -365, -368, -372-373, -376, -378, -380-381, -384-386, -390, -395, -400, -404, and -405.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names, employment information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Shopify Inc. v. Express Mobile, Inc.</i> , 2020 WL 4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 14, 2020); <i>American Auto. Ass'n of N. California, Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC</i> , 2019 WL 1206748, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019); <i>Opperman v. Path, Inc.</i> , 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 17, 2017).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-16; Exhibit PX 16 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	WF_SEB_00176695, -697-699.	<p>personal information of non-parties, including names and personal information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Shopify Inc. v. Express Mobile, Inc.</i>, 2020 WL 4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 14, 2020); <i>American Auto. Ass'n of N. California, Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC</i>, 2019 WL 1206748, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019); <i>Opperman v. Path, Inc.</i>, 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 17, 2017).</p>	
Dkt. No. 236-17: Exhibit PX 17 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00137913, -917-918, -920-921.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l</i></p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<p><i>Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Shopify Inc. v. Express Mobile, Inc.</i>, 2020 WL 4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 14, 2020); <i>American Auto. Ass'n of N. California, Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC</i>, 2019 WL 1206748, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019); <i>Opperman v. Path, Inc.</i>, 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 17, 2017).</p>	
<p>Dkt. No. 236-19: Exhibit PX 19 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason</p>	<p>Redacted Personal Identifying Information at pp. 3-4, 7, 12-13.</p>	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	<p>GRANTED</p>
<p>Dkt. No. 236-20: Exhibit PX 20 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)</p>	<p>Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 35:10; 69:11, 13, 18; 70:17,</p>	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names</p>	<p>GRANTED</p>

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	20; 218:5, 9.	that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"</i> <i>Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-23: Exhibit PX 23 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00121257- 258. <i>See</i> ECF No. 208-6.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non- parties, including names and employment information. This exact version of this document was filed with redactions as ECF No. 208-6. The Court approved the redactions to ECF No. 208-6 on March 25, 2025 (ECF No. 210). Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"</i> <i>Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-24: Exhibit PX 24 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00121479.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-27: Exhibit PX 27 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00161676.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao</i>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<i>Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-31: Exhibit PX 31 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 91:10; 153:7-9, 14-16, 19-20, 23; 154:15, 22; 186:15, 25.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names, that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-34: Exhibit PX 34 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at pp. 1-23.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l</i>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<i>Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-36: Exhibit PX 36 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00328507-501.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-37: Exhibit PX 37 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00138485-486.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P.	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-39: Exhibit PX 39 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00011936-939.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-50: Exhibit PX 40 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 16:8, 134:22, 135:1-4, 7, 9, 13-17, 22; 136:4, 11.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names, that can be used to readily identify the non-party	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-43: Exhibit PX 43 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00500874, -895, -902.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names, that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-44: Exhibit PX 44 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00507421, -	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names,	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	433.	that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"</i> <i>Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-45: Exhibit PX 45 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at pp. 1-4, 8-14, 16-17, 19, and 21.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non- parties, including names, and employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"</i> <i>Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-46: Exhibit PX 46 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
(1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	WF_SEB_00140420, -422-423.	<p>personal information of non-parties, including names and employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	
Dkt. No. 236-48: Exhibit PX 48 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00172661-662, -664, -666.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, and personal information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Dkt. No. 236-49: Exhibit PX 49 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00172678-681.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and personal information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-50: Exhibit PX 50 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00148888.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including information relating to protected classes.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Dkt. No. 236-51: Exhibit PX 51 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 128:4, 22; 130:9, 20; 131:15.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-53: Exhibit PX 53 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 144:24, 25; 145:10, 13, 17; 146:9-10, 14; 147:5-6, 12-13, 15.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL</p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-54: Exhibit PX 54 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 183:25; 229:8; 230:6, 11, 14, 19, 25; 231:8, 15, 18.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-57: Exhibit PX 57 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00236958, -960, -962-965.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D.</p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-60: Exhibit PX 61 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 136:6, 16; 137:8; 140:1, 7; 225:4, 7; 260:2, 8; 261:14-15, 22; 262:8; 263:4-5; 340:5-6, 10; 341:4; 342:23; 343:1, 8, 18.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-62: Exhibit PX 63 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00445493-576.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal.	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-63: Exhibit PX 64 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at pp. 1-2.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-64: Exhibit PX 65 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00146646.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods.</i></p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<i>Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-68: Exhibit PX 70 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 193:1, 11, 14, 18; 194:7, 12-13; 195:12-13, 18, 22; 196:7, 10, 24-25.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-69: Exhibit PX 71 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00109725-727.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re</i>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<i>Volkswagen “Clean Diesel” Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont’l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-71: Exhibit PX 74 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs’ Opp. to Defendants’ MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs’ Opp. to Defendants’ Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00261082-083.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen “Clean Diesel” Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont’l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-72: Exhibit PX 75 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs’ Opp. to Defendants’ MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs’ Opp. to Defendants’ Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00359005-006.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<p>non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	
<p>Dkt. No. 236-73: Exhibit PX 76 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason</p>	<p>Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00149700-701.</p> <p><i>See</i> ECF No. 224-14.</p>	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and personal information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>This exact version of this document was filed with redactions as ECF No. 224-14. The Court approved the redactions to ECF No. 224-14 on July 8, 2025 (ECF No. 228).</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v.</i></p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Shopify Inc. v. Express Mobile, Inc.</i> , 2020 WL 4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 14, 2020); <i>American Auto. Ass'n of N. California, Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC</i> , 2019 WL 1206748, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019); <i>Opperman v. Path, Inc.</i> , 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 17, 2017).	
Dkt. No. 236-80: Exhibit PX 83 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at pp. 1, 3-4.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-81: Exhibit PX 84 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at p. 1.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P.	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-82: Exhibit PX 85 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at pp. 1, 3.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-86: Exhibit PX 89 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00358890-893.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-87: Exhibit PX 90 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00147074- 075.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non- parties, including names, employment information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-88: Exhibit PX 91 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00358918-	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	920.	<p>parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	
Dkt. No. 236-90: Exhibit PX 93 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at 76:12, 18; 77:25; 78:9; 79:23; 80:8, 17-18.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-108: Exhibit PX 111 to Declaration of	Redacted Personal Identifying	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Information at WF_SEB_00020858- 859.	<p>Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and personal information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Defendants seek to redact the same information that was redacted in ECF No. 224-14, which is a different version of the same email chain as PX 111. The Court approved the redactions to ECF No. 224-14 on July 8, 2025 (ECF No. 228).</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Prac., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Shopify Inc. v. Express Mobile, Inc.</i>, 2020 WL 4732334, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 14, 2020); <i>American Auto. Ass'n of N. California, Nevada & Utah v. Gen. Motors LLC</i>, 2019 WL 1206748, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 14, 2019); <i>Opperman v. Path, Inc.</i>, 2017 WL 1036652, at *4 (N.D. Cal. Mar. 17, 2017).</p>	
Dkt. No. 236-121: Exhibit PX 128 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2)	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00438073.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"</i> <i>Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-124: Exhibit PX 133 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00146906- 907. <i>See</i> ECF No. 208-16.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non- parties, including names, employment information, personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. This exact version of this document was filed with redactions as ECF No. 208-16. The Court approved the redactions to ECF No. 208-16 on March 25, 2025 (ECF No. 210). Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"</i> <i>Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398,	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-125: Exhibit PX 135 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00236919-949.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-126: Exhibit PX 136 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00151378-382.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, and personal information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel"</i></p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<i>Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-127: Exhibit PX 137 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00281731-32, -735-736, -740, -744, -746.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names and employment information that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-129: Exhibit PX 139 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00518583-584.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	
Dkt. No. 236-130: Exhibit PX 140 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00338391-392.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual. Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i> , 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i> , 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i> , 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-132: Exhibit PX 142 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at pp. 1, 3.	The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason		<p>parties, in the form of names, employment information, personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	
Dkt. No. 236-137: Exhibit PX 147 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00358913-914.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Dkt. No. 236-138: Exhibit PX 148 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00594621.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).</p>	GRANTED
Dkt. No. 236-139: Exhibit PX 149 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Redacted Personal Identifying Information at WF_SEB_00252564-565.	<p>The factual basis for sealing the identified portions of this Exhibit is that they disclose personal information of non-parties, in the form of names that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Declaration of Brendan P. Cullen; <i>see also In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL</p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012).	

Upon consideration of the papers filed by the parties in connection with the Motion, it is hereby **ORDERED** that the following exhibits shall be sealed in their entirety:

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
Dkt. No. 236-41: Exhibit PX 41 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Entire Document	<p>The factual basis for sealing this Exhibit is that it discloses personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, personal information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Defendants' request to file this Exhibit in its entirety as it is a spreadsheet with over 3,500 rows that contain confidential information throughout, such that there is no suitable alternative to sealing the entire document.</p> <p><i>See In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Bohannon v. Facebook, Inc.</i>, 2019 WL 188671, at *6 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 14, 2019); <i>Murphy v.</i></p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<p><i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Kazda v. Aetna Life Ins. Co.</i>, 2022 WL 1225032, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 26, 2022); <i>Chula Vista Elem. Sch. Dist. v. Penagos</i>, 2024 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 147870, at *5 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 19, 2024); <i>Kimera Labs Inc v. Jayashankar</i>, 2025 WL 1399199, at *2 (S.D. Cal. May 14, 2025).</p>	
<p>Dkt. No. 236-42: Exhibit PX 42 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason</p>	<p>Entire Document</p>	<p>The factual basis for sealing this Exhibit is that it discloses personal information of non-parties, including names, employment information, and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Defendants' request to file this Exhibit in its entirety as it is a spreadsheet with over 10,000 rows that contain confidential information throughout, such that there is no suitable alternative to sealing the entire document.</p> <p><i>See In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Bohannon v. Facebook, Inc.</i>, 2019 WL 188671, at *6 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 14, 2019); <i>Murphy v.</i></p>	<p>GRANTED</p>

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<p><i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Kazda v. Aetna Life Ins. Co.</i>, 2022 WL 1225032, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 26, 2022); <i>Chula Vista Elem. Sch. Dist. v. Penagos</i>, 2024 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 147870, at *5 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 19, 2024); <i>Kimera Labs Inc v. Jayashankar</i>, 2025 WL 1399199, at *2 (S.D. Cal. May 14, 2025).</p>	
<p>Dkt. No. 236-123: Exhibit PX 132 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason</p>	<p>Entire Document</p>	<p>The factual basis for sealing this Exhibit is that it discloses personal information of non-parties, including names and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Defendants' request to file this Exhibit in its entirety as it is a spreadsheet with over 397 rows that contain confidential information throughout, such that there is no suitable alternative to sealing the entire document.</p> <p><i>See In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Bohannon v. Facebook, Inc.</i>, 2019 WL 188671, at *6 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 14, 2019); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL</p>	<p>GRANTED</p>

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		1497489, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Kazda v. Aetna Life Ins. Co.</i> , 2022 WL 1225032, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 26, 2022); <i>Chula Vista Elem. Sch. Dist. v. Penagos</i> , 2024 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 147870, at *5 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 19, 2024); <i>Kimera Labs Inc v. Jayashankar</i> , 2025 WL 1399199, at *2 (S.D. Cal. May 14, 2025).	
Dkt. No. 236-128: Exhibit PX 138 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Entire Document	<p>The factual basis for sealing this Exhibit is that it discloses personal information of non-parties, including names, employee identification numbers, work locations, and information related to protected classes that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Defendants' request to file this Exhibit in its entirety as it is a spreadsheet with over 132,000 rows that contain confidential information throughout such that there is no suitable alternative to sealing the entire document.</p> <p><i>See In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Bohannon v. Facebook, Inc.</i>, 2019 WL 188671, at *6 (N.D.</p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		Cal. Jan. 14, 2019); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Kazda v. Aetna Life Ins. Co.</i> , 2022 WL 1225032, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 26, 2022); <i>Chula Vista Elem. Sch. Dist. v. Penagos</i> , 2024 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 147870, at *5 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 19, 2024); <i>Kimera Labs Inc v. Jayashankar</i> , 2025 WL 1399199, at *2 (S.D. Cal. May 14, 2025).	
Dkt. No. 236-131: Exhibit PX 141 to Declaration of Sharan Nirmul ISO (1) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' MSJ and (2) Plaintiffs' Opp. to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Entire Document	<p>The factual basis for sealing this Exhibit is that it discloses personal information of non-parties, including names and factual circumstances that can be used to readily identify the non-party individual.</p> <p>Defendants' request to file this Exhibit in its entirety as it is a spreadsheet with over 1,667 rows that contain confidential information throughout such that there is no suitable alternative to sealing the entire document.</p> <p><i>See In re Volkswagen "Clean Diesel" Mktg., Sales Pracs., & Prods. Liab. Litig.</i>, 2016 WL 11807130, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Aug. 24, 2016); <i>Hunt v. Cont'l Cas. Co.</i>, 2015 WL 5355398, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Sept. 14, 2015); <i>Music Grp. Macao Com. Offshore Ltd. v. Foote</i>, 2015 WL 3993147, at *2 (N.D. Cal. June 30, 2015); <i>Murphy v. Kavo Am. Corp.</i>, 2012 WL 1497489, at *1 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Bohannon v. Facebook, Inc.</i>, 2019 WL 188671, at *6 (N.D. Cal. Jan. 14, 2019); <i>Murphy v.</i></p>	GRANTED

Docket No./Public (Sealed)	Portion Redacted	Evidence Offered in Support of Sealing (Factual Basis and Caselaw)	Ruling
		<i>Kavo Am. Corp.</i> , 2012 WL 1497489, at *2 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 27, 2012); <i>Kazda v. Aetna Life Ins. Co.</i> , 2022 WL 1225032, at *11 (N.D. Cal. Apr. 26, 2022); <i>Chula Vista Elem. Sch. Dist. v. Penagos</i> , 2024 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 147870, at *5 (S.D. Cal. Aug. 19, 2024); <i>Kimera Labs Inc v. Jayashankar</i> , 2025 WL 1399199, at *2 (S.D. Cal. May 14, 2025).	

Document	Materials to Be Filed Under Seal or Redacted	Basis for Sealing or Redaction	Ruling
Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment	Highlighted material at pp. 1-22, 24	Containing, describing, referencing, or implicating information designated confidential by Defendants under the Stipulated Protective Order (Dkt. No. 157).	GRANTED
Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Exclude the Testimony of Dr. Joseph R. Mason	Highlighted material at p. 11	Containing, describing, referencing, or implicating information designated confidential by Defendants under the Stipulated Protective Order (Dkt. No. 157).	GRANTED

DATED: September 25, 2025



Hon. Trina L. Thompson
United States District Judge
Northern District of California